

“Reflections on Publishing in Academic Journals: An Editor’s View”

**Ian Sheldon
(The Ohio State University)**

Seminar, USDA/ERS, Washington DC, March 14, 2011



DEPARTMENT OF
AGRICULTURAL, ENVIRONMENTAL,
AND DEVELOPMENT ECONOMICS

aede.osu.edu

Some Key Questions

- **Where to submit?**
- **When and what to submit?**
- **What happens next?**
- **What does editor's letter mean?**
- **What to do if rejected?**
- **How to respond to reviewers?**

Where to Submit?

- **Quality and type of journal**
- **Target journals with similar subject area(s)**
- **Have submission tree in mind – 3/4 journals**
- **Aim higher than eventual target**
- **Recognize trade-offs – acceptance rates vs. quality of reviews, turnaround times etc.**
- **No multiple submissions of same paper**
- **Diversify your submissions**

Journals Ranked by Impact: Economics

Rank	2008 Impact Factor	Impact 2004-08	Impact 1981-2008
1	Quart. J. Economics (5.05)	J. Economic Literature (10.92)	J. Economic Literature (69.89)
2	J. Economic Literature (4.84)	Quart. J. Economics (10.01)	Econometrica (60.92)
3	J. Economic Perspect. (3.94)	J. Political Economy (9.64)	J. Political Economy (56.95)
4	Econometrica (3.87)	J. Economic Growth (7.98)	Quart. J. Economics (49.43)
5	J. Political Economy (3.73)	J. Accounting & Econ. (6.76)	Bell J. Economics (46.57)
6	J. Financial Economics (3.54)	Econometrica (6.74)	J. Financial Economics (42.61)
7	Economic Geography (2.97)	J. Economic Perspect. (6.45)	American Economic Rev. (29.45)
8	J. Economic Geography (2.93)	J. Financial Economics (5.99)	J. Economic Perspect. (29.36)
9	J. Accounting & Econ. (2.85)	J. Economic Geography (5.33)	Rev. Economic Studies (29.20)
10	Rev. Economic Studies (2.63)	Rev. Economic Studies (5.29)	Rand J. Economics (24.50)

Source: *Journal Citations Report* (2009)

Abbreviated Journal Title	ISSN	2009 Total Cites	Impact Factor	5-Year Impact Factor	Immediacy Index	2009 Articles	Cited Half-life
AGR ECON-BLACKWELL	0169-5150	973	0.673	0.983	0.359	64	7.6
AM J AGR ECON	0002-9092	4189	1.047	1.642	0.212	132	>10.0
AUST J AGR RESOUR EC	1364-985X	328	1.055	1.244	0.188	32	5.9
CAN J AGR ECON	0008-3976	285	0.552	0.787	0.290	31	7.5
EUR REV AGRIC ECON	0165-1587	582	0.860	1.885	0.167	24	8.0
J AGR ECON	0021-857X	588	1.155	1.493	0.200	35	8.2
J AGR RESOUR ECON	1068-5502	427	0.474	0.827	0.000	29	8.4

Source: *Journal Citations Report* (2010)

Table 1: JOURNAL RANKINGS, 2008
Impact, Age and Self Citations Adjusted

Rank*	Journal Abbreviation	Citations Index	Citations/Article Index
1	AM ECON REV	100.0000	100.0000
2	Q J ECON	75.9197	59.6309
3	ECONOMETRICA	66.0654	44.7797
4	J POLIT ECON	53.8725	41.4496
5	REV ECON STUD	44.1817	32.6611
6	J MONETARY ECON	34.6689	27.8149
7	REV ECON STAT	28.7777	24.2411
8	J ECON THEORY	32.6343	22.5192
9	J PUBLIC ECON	22.6121	22.1975
10	ECON J	21.9844	20.8051
11	J ECON PERSPECT	20.5835	19.1574
12	J INT ECON	22.2429	19.1372
13	J ECON LIT	22.8814	18.3493
14	J ECONOMETRICS	17.4621	16.1703
15	J FINANC ECON	16.7346	15.6500
16	EUR ECON REV	17.8454	14.9099
17	RAND J ECON	15.8823	12.9813
18	INT ECON REV	16.5091	12.4167
19	J EUR ECON ASSOC	13.9716	12.1464
20	GAME ECON BEHAV	18.5236	12.0176

Source: Kalaitzidakis, Mamuneas, and Stengos (2010)

Journal	Acceptance Rate
<i>American Economic Review*</i>	0.07
<i>Econometrica*</i>	0.09
<i>Journal of Political Economy</i>	0.05
<i>Quarterly Journal of Economics</i>	0.04
<i>BEJ Applied Economics (All 4 Levels)*</i>	0.51
<i>Canadian Journal of Economics</i>	0.18
<i>Economica</i>	0.11
<i>Economics Letters</i>	0.17
<i>Industrial and Labor Relations Review</i>	0.18
<i>Journal of Human Resources</i>	0.10
<i>Journal of Labor Economics</i>	0.08
<i>Journal of Monetary Economics</i>	0.20
<i>Journal of Population Economics</i>	0.21
<i>Journal of Public Economics</i>	0.10
<i>Labour Economics*</i>	0.15
<i>Review of Economics and Statistics</i>	0.12

When and What to Submit?

- **Present paper first, get feedback etc.**
- **Paper should be well-written**
- **Observe length guidelines of journal**
- **Do not strategize over acknowledgements**
- **No need to follow detailed style instructions**
- **Write a very short letter of submission**
- **Follow electronic submission guidelines**

What Happens Next?

- **Desk-rejection or out for review**
- **Paper sent to reviewers**
- **Double vs. single-blind review**
- **Turnaround times for initial submission**
- **When to contact editor?**
- **Letter from the editor**

A Digression

- **Debate over double vs. single blind:**
 - Blank (1991): acceptance rates lower/reviews tougher under double-blind, similar patterns for male/female authors
 - *Nature* (2000) reported 71% of respondents confident in double-blind, support highest among humanities/social sciences, and among female authors
- **Turnaround times:**
 - first-response typically 3-6 months for economics journals, and has got longer over past 40 years (Azar, 2007)
 - many suggestions for improving turnaround times, e.g., higher submission fees, paying referees etc. (Azar, 2006)

What Does Editor's Letter Mean?

- **Outright rejection most common**
- **Reject/door open letter very common:**
 - **indication paper requires major revision**
 - **no promise to publish**
- **A revise and resubmit less common**
- **An outright acceptance is rare**

What to Do If Rejected?

- **Everyone gets rejected**
- **Put letter and reviews aside for a week**
- **Re-read and assess why rejected**
- **Do not write angry letter to editor**
- **Revise manuscript if necessary**
- **Submit to next journal on tree**
- **Consign to filing cabinet if fourth rejection**

How to Respond to Reviewers?

- **Read reviews carefully**
- **Figure out substantive concerns**
- **Revise paper accordingly**
- **Respond to concerns and describe manner in which paper has been revised**
- **Do not insult reviewers in response**
- **Re-submit**

How to Respond to Reviewers?

- **Read reviews carefully**
- **Figure out substantive concerns**
- **Revise paper accordingly**
- **Respond to concerns and describe manner in which paper has been revised**
- **Do not insult reviewers in response**
- **Re-submit**

Bibliography

- Azar, O.H. “The Academic Review Process: How Can We Make It More Efficient?” *American Economist* 50(2006): 37-50
- Azar, O.H. “The Slowdown in First-Response Times of Economics Journals: Can it be Beneficial?” *Economic Inquiry* 45(2007): 179-87
- Blank, R.M. “The Effects of Double-Blind versus Single-Blind Reviewing: Experimental Evidence from *The American Economic Review*,” *American Economic Review* 81(1991): 1041-1067
- Hammermeshm D.S. “The Young Economist’s Guide to Professional Etiquette,” *Journal of Economic Perspectives* 6(1992): 169-79
- Kalaitzidakis, P., Mamuneas, T.P., and Stengos, T. (2010) “An Updated Ranking of Academic Journals in Economics”, Working Paper
- Liebowitz, S.J. and Palmer, J.P. “Assessing the Relative Impacts of Economic Journals,” *Journal of Economic Literature* 22(1984): 77-88
- Nature “Working double-blind: should there be author anonymity in peer review?” *Nature* 451 (February 2008): 605-6